



## MINUTES OF THE REGIONAL COORDINATING COMMITTEE (RCC) MEETING

held at Shamrock Sagada, Mt. Province  
on 17 December 2014

### Present were:

- |                            |   |
|----------------------------|---|
| 1. Cameron P. Odsey        | -RCC Chairman & Project Manager                                       |
| 2. Rosemarie G. Badival    | - Representative of Tuho C. Chapdian, PPDO staff- Benguet             |
| 3. Carmelita B. Buyuccan   | - RCC Member, PPDC & Provincial Action Officer- Ifugao                |
| 4. Norma Frances U. Damian | - RCC Member, PPDC & Provincial Action Officer- Kalinga               |
| 5. Octavia S. Ablos        | - Representative of Aida Pagtan, SMPPI staff                          |
| 6. JR Balag-ey A. Claver   | - RCC Member & CWCFFMA Coordinator and PCO Kalinga                    |
| 7. Ghisleen Bacwaden       | - Representative of Leonora Verzola, AAIGA staff                      |
| 8. Filemon A. Salvador     | - RCC Member & RID Coordinator  |
| 9. Isabel B. Tejo          | - Representative of Charles Picpican, PM&E officer                    |
| 10. Robert L. Domoguen     | - RCC Member & IKM Coordinator  |
| 11. Kristle Ann Balingan   | - Representative of Daniel T. Dalilis Jr., Admin staff                |
| 12. Rosemarie B. Tesoro    | - RCC Member & Provincial Coordination Officer- Abra                  |
| 13. Digna D. Villanueva    | - RCC Member & Provincial Coordination Officer- Apayao                |
| 14. Gabriel C. Pacio       | - RCC Member & Provincial Coordination Officer- Benguet               |
| 15. Jerry N. Damoyan       | - RCC member & Provincial Coordination Officer- Ifugao                |
| 16. Cecil Capegsan         | - Representative of Beverly Pekas, Provincial Supervisor-Mt. Province |

### Also present were:

1. Other LGU representatives (*refer to attendance*)
2. CHARM2 Project Technical and support staff (*refer to attendance*)

### AGENDA:

1. Overall physical Project progress;
2. Status of liquidation per component per Province;
3. Catch-up plan for 2014 and 2015 AWPB;
4. Implementation issues and gaps affecting the Project; and,
5. Other matters affecting Project implementation.

### MEETING PROPER

#### a. Brief profile of the participants

Regional Coordinating Committee (RCC) meeting participants is composed of the Provincial Action Officer of the six(6) Provinces of the Cordilleras. The presence of the various concerned provincial offices or units [*Office of the Provincial Agriculturist (OPAg); Office of the Provincial Engineer (PEO); and, Office of the Provincial Environment and Natural Resources (PENRO)*] were also requested; thus, their presence. However, this month's RCC, no partner Local Government Unit (LGU) participants came from Abra and Apayao due to their respective Province's activity; notwithstanding the absence of other expected LGU participants, there was a quorum. Other support staff from the different provinces were present as well. The Municipal Mayor of Sagada as the host Municipality sent his representative to welcome the participants.

## **b. Proceedings**

The activity started with an opening prayer led by Ms. Cecil Capuyan, Provincial Supervisor (PS) of Mt. Province Community Mobilization Officers. Afterwhich, Ms. Aiza Apil, Mt. Province Provincial Agribusiness Facilitator led the singing of the National Anthem.

Having asked the participants to take their seats, Project Manager Cameron P. Odsey, being the presiding officer, invited the participants to introduce themselves. From which, he determined that there was a quorum.

Consequently, the Chairman invited Ms. Cheryl April Castro for the opening and welcome remarks. She is the Municipal Tourist Information officer representing Sagada Mayor Eduardo T. Latawan, Jr. for this meeting. She informed that the Mayor has an urgent matter to attend to in Cervantes Ilocos Sur. Ms. Castro enthusiastically delivered the message of the Mayor and warmly welcomed all the participants. She expressed hope for the participants to enjoy their stay in Sagada.

Likewise, after her message, she shared a video clip showing the various tourists spot of the Municipality that the participants may visit after the meeting should they want to explore the place.

In succession, Engr. Salvador noted that this meeting and the last RCC was composed of mostly the same people. He therefore moved to suspend the reading and the review of the Minutes of the last RCC meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Carmelita Buyuccan, Provincial Planning and Development Coordinator (PPDC) and Provincial Action Officer (PAO) of Ifugao. No objections were raised to the suggestion; thus, review of the minutes of the previous RCC meeting was dispensed.

In succession, the Chairman invited the body to go over the matters arising from the minutes of the RCC meeting last October in Tabuk City, Kalinga. Raised to be discussed were on the status of plantation establishment of the reforestation and agroforestry subprojects; the liquidation of Livelihood Assistance Fund (LAF) by Livelihood Interest Groups (LIGs); and the delayed implementation of infrastructure subprojects. It was determined that status updates on these matters would be part of the component presentations; thus, the body proceeded on the next item in the agenda.

Afterwhich, Dr. Odsey gave an update regarding the Knowledge and Learning Market-Policy Engagement (KLM-PE) of the Project conducted last November 18-19, 2014 at the Crown Legacy Hotel in Baguio City spearheaded by the Information and Knowledge Management (IKM) Unit of the Project. He shared that the forum was actively participated in by various Project Stakeholders. Likewise, Livelihood Interest Groups (LIGs) and other Peoples Organizations (POs) were invited as exhibitors to showcase their products for the appreciation of the public in their various Province's booth. He went on to say that the Project has also displayed various publications under the Project. The activity featured the presentation of policy recommendations under the various components. The policy engagement include discussion on the following: School-on-Air under IKM; Covenanting under CWC/FMA; talkshow with the POs discussing about their activities and products; etc.

He continued to say that during the second day, in time of the 6th year anniversary of the Project, the occasion was graced with the presence of Secretary Proceso J. Alcalá. Likewise, Governor Habawel of Ifugao and LGU representatives including some Mayors were also present. He conveyed that the Secretary was satisfied with what the Project was able to do based on his comments and words of appreciation.

The Project Manager remarked that the Project, on 2015 at its final year of implementation, will be preparing for the last and perhaps the best KLM and Anniversary. He solicited the usual participation and support of the partner LGUs.

In behalf of the PME Coordinator who is currently attending an activity pertaining to evaluation and performance for the preparation of the Project completion report, the Chairman invited Ms. Isabel Tejo to present the overall physical and financial performance of the Project.

## Project Physical & Financial Performance

Ms. Isabel B. Tejo reported that the overall progress of the Project as of 30<sup>th</sup> November 2014 is 87.10%. The CHARMP2 Cumulative Physical Performance-curve showed that the Project is 7.89% shy of the November target of 96.87% or 10.71% slippage of its Annual target on its 73<sup>rd</sup> month or 84.76% time elapsed.

In terms of the Project's financial performance, it has obligated 78% of its total allocation and has disbursed 60% amounting to ₱968,694,784.89 of its total obligation. Per category against total obligations, disbursement is pegged at 49.77% for civil works; 73.15% for vehicles, equipment and materials; 65.48% for trainings and studies; 87.03% for advisory services; 51.09% for credit or LAF; and, 81.83% for allowances and miscellaneous.

Ms. Tejo also presented updates on financial performance against the loan proceeds. As of November 2014, she reported that of the total obligations, the Project was able to disburse 50% of IFAD funds and 84% of OFID funds or 56% of both IFAD and OFID obligated funds. On disbursement by source, 61% of IFAD and 39% of OFID were already disbursed of the total loan proceeds.

Briefly, she also presented the general features of the C.Y. 2015 AWPB that was approved and endorsed by the Regional Inter-agency Steering Committee on its meeting last December 4, 2014 to IFAD. She mentioned that it features the full implementation of the Livelihood Assistance Fund (LAF), the phase-out and sustainability planning activities of the Project; the shifting of CMO functions for more focused support to LIG activities and reforestation and agroforestry Peoples Organizations, the allocation of funds across components to ensure delivery of output by the end of the Project, and, the project completion report preparation process which will be composed of stakeholder workshops, benefits and impact study and thematic studies.

The tables below show the summary of the 2015 AWPB approved and endorsed by the RISC to IFAD as reported.

**Table 1: Distribution of 2015 CHARMP2 budget by Category by Source**

Cost Category	Summary (P'000)			
	IFAD-LP	IFAD- Grant	GOP	Total
Civil works				
Supplies & materials	31,188		1,660	32,848
Trainings & studies	92,795	4,800	6,444	104,039
Advisory Services	54,438		3,782	58,220
Livelihood Assistance Fund	6,702			6,702
Recurrent Cost	32,566		2,929	35,495
<b>Total</b>	<b>217,689</b>	<b>4,800</b>	<b>14,815</b>	<b>237,304</b>

**Table 2: Distribution of 2015 CHARMP2 budget by Component**

Component	NEP	Grant Fund (P'000)	Budget LP and GOP (P'000)	Adjusted Total Budget
Social Mobilization, Participatory Investment Planning	3,686		21,000	21,000
Community Watershed Conservation, Forest Management and Agroforestry	17,000		24,000	24,000
Agriculture, Agribusiness and Income Generating Activities	143,948		100,958	100,958
Rural Infrastructure Development	48,156		39,481	39,481
Project Management and Coordination	19,714	4,800	47,065	51,865
<b>Total</b>	<b>232,504</b>	<b>4,800</b>	<b>232,504</b>	<b>237,304</b>

After the presentation, the RCC Chair further explained that the 87.10% achievement is more realistic than the 97.81% target as the Project has one (1) more year to go. He commented that it would be a challenge to the Project on how to accomplish the remaining 12.90%, which he said to be something doable, to achieve 100% by December 31, 2015.

He continued to elaborate the presentation saying that the presented remaining targets for civil works and Livelihood Assistance Fund (LAF) are already covered by contracts. He went on to say that at this time of the meeting, the Project has already released 26,000,000.00 of the 58,000,000.00 obligated for LAF. He then emphasized that the Project is really facing problems on disbursement or the slow liquidation of fund transferred to POs, Contractors and LGUs which causes the lack of availability of cash. He went on to say that the Project needs to withdraw all OFID loan by end of the year. He said that this is not a critical problem. However, for the IFAD loan, he reiterated and emphasized that disbursement is critical. He shared that IFAD is saying, the Project will again be rated unsatisfactory on its next mission if it could not disburse 50% of the whole IFAD loan until December 2014.

### **Highlights from the discussion on 'Problematic' subprojects**

Since this forum is a problem-solving meeting, the body did away with the usual presentation from the Provinces. Instead, discussion focused on the "problematic" subprojects.

#### **1. Community Watershed Conservation, Forest Management and Agroforestry (CWC/FMA)**

- Component Coordinator JR Balag-ey Claver presented the status of liquidation of funds of PO's under Reforestation and Agroforestry. It was observed that there was discrepancy in figures on disbursements and liquidations with the Accounting report. He explained that it is possibly due to different report dates but assured that this can be reconciled. He further clarified that some amount of unreleased cheques is included in the total of unliquidated funds and that the actual amount of unliquidated fund is less or about ₱26,000,000.00. He was confident that by first quarter of 2015, the Component will be able to attain zero balance on the ₱16,771,668.41 unliquidated amount as it only requires a one-time procurement.
- Mr. Claver highlighted on the following unliquidated balances per Province totalling to ₱1,793,694.65 and called the attention of the respective provincial coordinators:
  - Benguet- ₱499,567.50
  - Ifugao- ₱268,740.00
  - Kalinga- ₱265,620.75
  - Mt. Province- ₱759,766.40

He went on to say that based on the component's knowledge, the reason behind the unclaimed cheques for Benguet, Ifugao and Mt. Province resulting to unliquidated balances are the unavailability of POs' renewed official receipt and different names of POs from the covenant and the official receipt.

Ms. Roshiel Dogui-is, Assisting Professional for Benguet commented that receipt of the Natublang Agroforestry group is for printing at the moment. As for Ifugao, it was made known that Ms. Jonalyn Cabbigat, AP for Ifugao just claimed the check. For Kalinga, it was said that their receipt has lapsed already and for Mt. Province, PO of Barlig has a problem with their receipt as well. It was clarified that the POs are DOLE-registered but BIR required them to be registered at SEC as commented by Ms. Tumapang of Mt. Province OPAg. After which, Mr. Claver voiced that he had once asked Mr. Diego of ENRO to talk with BIR and they had favored one (1) PO. He commented that this has already been raised a year ago and had suggested to lobby this once more with BIR.

The Chairman asked Ms. Cecil Capegsan to know and give update if somebody went to BIR to resolve the above-pending issue. Moreover, to tackle issues during the Reforestation Committee Meeting in Bontoc, Mt. Province the next day in time with their regular meeting.

## 2. Agriculture, Agribusiness and Income Generating Activities (AAIGA)

- Mr. Ghisleen Bacwaden, Component staff presented the status of Livelihood Assistance Funds (LAF) released to the provinces.
- On the unliquidated balances, the Provincial Coordinators were once more asked for updates.
  - For Abra, Dr. Rosemarie B. Tesoro said that Abra is on the process of liquidation and committed that by next week, December 22 and 23, 2014, liquidation reports will be submitted to the Project Support Office (PSO).
  - For Apayao, they were commended for having liquidated all LAF released to the LIGs.
  - For Benguet, there were five (5) Coffee LIGs that have not yet liquidated funds. However, was committed to liquidate by the end of December 2014.
  - For Ifugao, Mr. Bacwaden said that HOJAP will be able to liquidate this December or early January next year. The Chairman asked Provincial Coordinator Jerry Damoyan to follow-up with Mr. Jimmy Lingayo of RTFC on liquidation as he committed to liquidate release of the LAF to the cooperative.
  - For Kalinga, Ms. Sharon Boguen corrected that all LIGs on Banana had already submitted their liquidation reports. As for the LIG of Poswoy, she commented that they are moving as per workplan and by this month, they will be able to release the fund to the LIGs. It was agreed that the claimed submitted reports be verified at PSO.
  - For Mt. Province, three (3) LIGs have not yet liquidated funds. Moreover, it was pointed out that some liquidation reports submitted were not supported with the required documents. The Chairman directed AAIGA to clarify the documentary requirement for liquidating LAF with the Accounting Unit and official communication regarding this will be disseminated to the Provinces.

## 3. Rural Infrastructure Development (RID)

- Engineer Filemon Salvador, RID Coordinator delivered the report of the Component. To address the tabled matters arising during the previous RCC meeting under the RID component, he said that as of the time of the meeting, no 2nd NOL yet is released for the Villa-Viciosa FMR. This is because the queries of IFAD regarding qualification of the Contractor's personnel have not yet been addressed. The Chairperson charged Engr. Salvador and Engr. Mayapit to follow-up the submission of the said certification of personnel qualification to IFAD with NIA. Likewise, to ensure the progress of the concerned subproject as this has been long overdue.
- Regarding the IFAD-funded Community Infrastructures in Kalinga and Mt. Province that are still for bidding, RID and the provincial coordinators were directed to follow-up on it.
- Engr. Salvador also presented a list of 25 delayed infrastructure subprojects that should be 50% completed by December 31, 2014. It was pointed out that failure to complete subprojects on the mentioned date will entail the non-approval of the 60-day time extension. From the list, the remaining two (2) out of three (3) CIS in Ifugao are expected to be completed by January 2015. As for the Butbut-Sungang-Poblacion FMR, according to Engineer Bayong, it may be completed this month of the year and Mr. Odsey requested Mr. Claver to follow-up on it. For the Balawangki-Kinggasa FMR, Ms. Tumapang of OPAg Mt. province was requested to inform PEO to follow-up on the subproject and the other RI subprojects of their Province as well.
- It was emphasized that Pakang-Chaliwatey subproject must complete work by December. Engr. Salvador commented that it can be completed but the system could not be used yet.
- Regarding the Provincial nurseries, Mr. Claver and Mr. Damoyan were directed to follow-up on liquidation reports due from Ifugao, otherwise, to return cash to PSO. Mr. Bahatan claimed during the previous RCC that ₱700,000.00 had been liquidated but until now, the report shows otherwise. It was agreed that this must be monitored.

- For the Pula FMR, Engr. Salvador commented that he relayed to Engineer Archie that admin cost has already been downloaded to the LGU as the subproject is under the CFA.
- Regarding the payment for on-going and completed subprojects, about ₱34,000,000.00 is needed to pay the concerned subprojects. However, the Project Manager explained that due to the slow liquidation, there is only a limited amount of cash available for payment of dues.

## 10. Other Matters

There were no representative this time from NCIP as they are having their year-end assessment accordingly. Anyhow, the Project Manager gave a brief update on the ultimatum for NCIP during the supervision mission of IFAD last February this year. He mentioned that the three (3) CADTs have passed first and second readings. However, the third reading faced technicality problems. Hence, to wait for further updates from NCIP.

Meanwhile, IKM Officer Robert L. Domoguen informed the RCC that the Project will be producing a CHARM legacy book that will include the story of each project component's experience in each of the provinces covered by the CHARM2 Project. He offered some encouragement; saying that *"In spite of battles lost or won, let us all win the war next year."* The Project Manager added that it will as well be integrated in the Project Completion Report.

Consequently, the Chairperson invited Ms. Cecil Capegsan to brief the body on the supposed project site visit itinerary. Ms. Capegsan informed the meeting participants that the planned site visit was scrapped because the PO's processing center is closed as they are in Manila in time with the Gawad Saka awarding. However those who wished to go around the municipality were advised to register at the MLGU office first.

The next RCC meeting will be in Apayao; tentatively in January or February 2015. Likewise, the first RISC meeting for CY 2015 will be held after the IFAD Completion Mission that is slated in March, 2015.

Prepared by:

Noted by:

**MICHELLE C. MENDOZA**  
OPM Staff

**CAMERON P. ODSEY**  
Project Manager